

**Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock, and Irrigation
The Republic of the Union of Myanmar**

Department of Rural Development

National Community Driven Development Project



**Myanmar National Community Driven Development
Project**

Report of the Union-Level Multi-Stakeholder Review

Nay Pyi Taw, 21st September 2017

Table of Contents

| | Content | Page No. |
|-----|--|-----------------|
| 1. | Introduction | 1 |
| 2. | Meeting Date & Location | 1 |
| 3. | Objective | 1 |
| 4. | Participants | 1 |
| 5. | Opening Remarks and Award Ceremony | 2 |
| 6. | Prior Fora in the Annual MSR Process | 1 |
| 6. | Presentation of Year 4 Annual Highlights | 3 |
| 7. | Panel Discussion | 3 |
| 8. | Summary of Discussions from UMSR and Prior Fora | 4 |
| 9. | Closing Remarks | 5 |
| 10. | Photos | 7 |
| 11. | Annexes | 10 |
| | Annex 1 : Schedule of the Union Multi-Stakeholder Review | 11 |
| | Annex 2 : Participants at the Union Multi-Stakeholder Review | 13 |
| | Annex 3 : Opening Remarks by His Excellency Dr Aung Thu | 14 |
| | Annex 4 : Opening Remarks by Ms Ellen Goldstein | 16 |
| | Annex 5 : Detailed Outputs of MSR Discussion Groups | 19 |

This report summarizes proceedings and outputs of 4th Year Union-level Multi-Stakeholder Review (MSR) of National Community Driven Development Project (NCDDP) implemented by Department of Rural Development, Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Irrigation in collaboration with the World Bank. The MSR was held at Myanmar International Convention Center (MICC II) in Nay Pyi Taw on 21st and 22nd September 2017.

Introduction

1. The community project cycle of NCDDP is implemented in 6 stages : community preparation, planning, sub-project preparation, sub-project consultation and review, sub-project implementation and sub-project closing. The Union level multi-stakeholder review (MSR) is held in order to collect and process feedback from the community and wider stakeholders' suggestions for improving the coming cycle by discussing and reviewing the highlights, lesson learned and challenges of project implementation during the previous cycle, including the findings of technical, financial and social audits.

Meeting Date & Location

2. The fourth Union level multi-stakeholder review was held on Thursday, 21 September 2017, 9:00hr to 17:00hr at Myanmar Convention Center (MICC-II), Nay Pyi Taw.

Objective

3. The objective of the union level multi-stakeholder review of NCDDP is to reflect and share on highlights, lessons learned and challenges from NCDDP implementation during the previous cycle and identify and apply the suggestions from discussions in the coming cycle.

Participants

4. Dr.Aung Thu, Minister of Agriculture, Livestock and Irrigation, opened the meeting by emphasizing the importance of this meeting and Vice Ministers, Nay Pyi Taw Councils, Chairman and Members of Parliament of 4 Parliamentary Committee from Pyithu Hluttaw and Amyotha Hluttaw, Committee Members, Representatives of Department of Rural Development, Departmental Officials, Township Administrators, Union and Township Technical Assistance, Representatives of respective Embassy, the World Bank representatives, and multi-department development partners representatives, a total of 803 stakeholders attended. (See the breakdown of participants in Annex 2).

Prior Fora in the Annual MSR Process

5. Before conducting the Union-level multi-stakeholder review, the CF Forum, TF Forum, KE Forum were held on 14/15.08.2017, 17/18.08.2017 and 21/22.08.2017, 24/25.08.2017 and 28/29.08.2017, from 3.8.2017 to 8.8.2017 respectively. In these fora, township project staff, INGOs/NGOs and civil society organizations discussed the lessons learned, achievements, and suggestions for the project under each sector.

Opening Remarks and Award Ceremony

6. The Union MSR was opened by Minister Dr. Aung Thu, who highlighted that the NCDDP was one of the key projects to reflect the National Economic Policy, since it is developing the sectors of roads and bridges, water supply, electrification, education, etc, in order to reduce the gap between rural and urban community living standards, foster good practices of democracy amongst the community, develop community capacity, plan and implement the required socio-economic development infrastructure to properly exploit our own or regional-owned resources.

The CDD project has now completed its fourth cycle, with the objective of ensuring social infrastructure development, an essential component of rural development, bringing about improved public services through a people-centered approach which creates resilient communities. The project has been extended or scaled up due to its achievements, transparency, technical standards, sustainability, cooperation and monitoring by the respective organizations. We need to build strong capacity of the community to operate and maintain the projects themselves, thus reducing the old centralized and top down management system when implementing the project nationwide. The suggestions from various organizations who attended this meeting are very important. The opening remark by the Minister of Agriculture, Livestock and Irrigation is attached in the Annex 1.

7. Following the Minister, Ms. Ellen Goldstein, Country Director of the World Bank, delivered opening remarks which emphasized that we come together with the project having just completed its fourth year of operations working at village, village tract, and township levels across the country. In the last year, the project has been scaled up to all states and regions of the country, almost doubling in size to cover a total of approximately 8,600 villages in 47 townships that are home to more than 5 million people. This cycle has delivered tremendous results on the ground, with tangible impacts on the day-to-day lives of communities. Schools have been expanded and improved, footpaths, roads, bridges and jetties rehabilitated, and new water supply systems built.

You will hear more about the specific progress in these areas but the almost 14,000 subprojects completed to date, including 6,800 in the last 12 months alone, in support of a wide-range of essential rural services has been truly impressive. In reflecting on the theme of this multi-stakeholder review—resilience—and on some of the words of the Minister, this event is in keeping with core principles of resilience: diversity, feedback, open to critique and seeking ways to improve. In these areas, NCDDP is doing a tremendous job – through your regular subproject monitoring and grievance redress systems, the social audits at the village level, the township multi-stakeholder reviews, and through today’s event. The NCDDP is not just helping to make communities resilient, but I believe it is also making communities more resourceful to respond to and take advantage of current and future challenges they face. This in my mind is the essence of empowerment, which is at the core of the NCDDP. The opening remark by the Country Director of the World Bank is attached in Annex 3.

8. After the opening remarks, awards were presented to the village tracts and villages from 47 townships (see table in Annex D) which successfully implemented the NCDDP subprojects.

Presentation of Year 4 Annual Highlights

9. Following the award ceremony, U Hla Khaing, Director of the Union DRD, presented the a summary of the project highlights in video form, featuring accomplishment of project implementation from the fourth year, results from the technical audit and social audit of completed sub-projects, reports from township MSR, and some achievements (<http://cdd.drdmyanmar.org/en/media/umsr-presentations-u-hla-khaing>).

Panel Discussion

10. Following the Union DRD presentation, U Khant Zaw, Director General of the Department of Rural Development, facilitated a panel discussion that featured three guests : Mr. Sean Bradley (World Bank), Daw Myat Moe Thwe (Deputy Director General of the Ministry of Social Welfare), and Mr Leo Roozendahl (Country Manager, MercyCorps). The discussion covered the topics of community resilience development, gender aspects, fragility and conflict related issues. After that U Khant Zaw opened the discussion to the floor to discuss with participants from parliament, departmental organizations, INGO/NGOs and civil society organizations. Following that, the discussion focused on questions raised by participants and answered by the authorized person. The questions and answers are as follows:
 - a. Question raised by MP: “Can the 5% O&M fund be allocated during implementation?” DG U Khant Zaw clarified that the 5% can only be used in the final year of implementation (Year 4). Currently we in process of transferring this 5% to the two townships in their fourth and last cycle.
 - b. Question raised by village representative of Chin State: “Can we get a larger block grant, since the current block grant amount is not enough. Paletwa Township has 96 village tracts and 383 villages, and it has the maximum number of villages ?” U Khant Zaw replied that the block grant allocation needs to follow the operation manual terms and we can only allocate according to the OM terms.
 - c. Question raised by MP from Ayeyarwaddy Region: “Can the project be implemented not only in the village but also in the township?” U Khant Zaw explained that the development mandate of DRD covers specifically rural areas, therefore a DRD implemented project such as NCDDP cannot be implemented within the urban township areas, which is under other line ministries.
 - d. Question from MP from Magway Region “Is there any plan to extend the project townships in Magway Region?”. U Khant Zaw replied that we have a plan to add townships in Magway Region during the next (and last) cycle.
 - e. Question from MP: “How to proceed after the project cycle ends?” U Khant Zaw clarified that the World Bank will assess the sub-projects in the project cycle finished townships, and the O&M design will be planned in order to ensure sustainability of social and physical infrastructure.

Summary of Discussions from UMSR and Prior Fora

11. The following outcomes came out from MSR and prior discussion fora. Details of discussions at the UMSR itself are given in Annex .

(A) Key Areas to Improve and Update the Existing Operations Manual

| No. | Discussion Topic |
|-----|--|
| 1) | State & Region level representatives should be stated in OM. |
| 2) | Right to withdraw from current project cycle for those villages which have difficulty to organize/ meeting with sufficient attendance (quorum) up to 3 times |
| 3) | The project finished townships should send grievance letters to DRD. |
| 4) | Highest grievance handling mechanism should be till State/Region level. |
| 5) | To issue instructions exclusively about the working methods related to Exit Strategy |
| 6) | To include specified office phone number on phone sticker which is going to distribute |
| 7) | More posters should be issued instead of pamphlets. Soft copy should be provided to the townships and carried out with their own plan. |
| 8) | CSAG should directly mentor at least once in the trainings provided to the village representatives |
| 9) | Case studies should be added in the trainings |
| 10) | At the new townships, township administrators and township project officers should be invited to Start-up Training |

(B) Key Areas to Improve and Update Gender Aspects

| No. | Discussion Topic |
|-----|---|
| 1) | To approach ethnic minority leaders. Women should be given their place in the skill sectors, coordinated with respective authorities for the safety of women when attending meetings. |
| 2) | Ensure participation/attendance of minority groups meeting by careful screening and coordination of venue, date and time. |
| 3) | Invitation of women to separate meeting |
| 4) | The meeting should be held during women free time |
| 5) | To give opportunity to speak up and discuss to women and they should be acknowledged and recognized. |
| 6) | Raise awareness in the meeting (deliver training to the community) |

(C) Discussion points for Infrastructure, O&M and Safeguards Issues

| No. | Discussion Topic |
|-----|--|
| 1) | <p>-Pg -144, Form-14</p> <p>(1) To change "Occupation" instead of "Position" of Land owner. (only for Myanmar version)</p> <p>(2) In the second table, to state exactly "land type" instead of "land situation for SP" For example- (Farm-Land, Housing land with grant/ without grant) to extend the column with enough space)</p> <p>(3) To change 'Donation area' instead of 'The affected area (square) feet'</p> |

| | |
|----|---|
| | <p>(4) Voluntary Donation. If the land owner does not want to donate, he/she can reject with no any signing in the form. To change '<i>If there want to request the compensation for the land owner, there can do adjustment with the village arrangement in other proper way without using project fund</i>' instead of '<i>Available compensation</i>'.</p> <p>(5) For signing of land donation, there should be a space for '<i>Village administrator</i>' to sign as a witness (1).</p> <p>(6) As a witness (2), (See Annex (1)), suggested to change the above.</p> |
| 2) | <p>- Pg15/ paragraph -26- line 3: (1) To change 'a priority sub-project should have at least (1.5) million based on the village needs' instead of 'In the second and third year, each sub-project should have at least (2) million'</p> <p>Pg- 16, Paragraph - 27, Line – 8 (2) To change 'The DRD union office should be informed (within one month) instead of (immediately).</p> |
| 3) | <p>Pg- 222, Paragrph-371 Should add one more paragraph relating with O&M plan – (1) To add in the O&M plan- In the project final year townships (The excess funds of project final year + incidental excess funds + 5%) (2) Each representative from villages should be informed in the use of O&M fund allocation. (3) In the final year townships, in order to keep O&M funds, there should form new O&M committee with (5) members and it will allow to use with (3) committee members' signature.</p> |
| 4) | <p>- (1)Pg - 238, table 5-6 (e) To confirm English to Myanmar translation difference (Measurement) (min 80x80x100cm) (2)Pg -238, table 5-6, Under the Sub-Project Type title. To change "under 40 KV" instead of "under 20 KV"</p> |
| 5) | <p>Pg-83; Paragraph 272 To add after the last sentence - "<i>In Revise Estimate, it can be calculated with local price</i>"</p> |
| 6) | <p>Pg.182 - Sub-Project Contractor's Code of Conduct - - To add "<i>Labour must be used construction safeguard materials</i>"</p> |

(D) Key Areas to Improve and Update the M & E Forms (Chapter 3)

| No. | Discussion |
|-----|---|
| 1) | Village level trainings should be provided only 1 day. |
| 2) | 1 M&E/MIS Assistant should be assigned at State/Region level. |
| 3) | Gender aspect should be added in the report. Gender report should be added in OM. |
| 4) | To change to "Hospital" in PC 1 to "Station Hospital" (appropriate for a village) |
| 5) | Budget spending for township level trainings should be stated in OM. |
| 6) | Other TTA/TL/DRD from Townships should also be given the M&E/MIS trainings. |

Closing Remarks

12. Following the group discussion, Dr Khin Zaw, Permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Irrigation delivered the closing remarks regarding the group discussion outcomes attended by a wide range of stakeholders, including Members of

Parliament, Departmental Officials, Representatives from NGO/INGOs, and project staff. Discussions covered 8 topics, including Infrastructure, M&E/ MIS, Procurement, Management, Grievance, Finance, Conflict and Gender.

Key issues raised in each group are noted as:

- (a) Infrastructure : land donation and village priority sub-project.
- (b) M & E / MIS : Data filling and training requirement from M&E / MIS team
- (c) Supervision & management : Field Trip %, project cycle operating, ways to sort out for personnel requirements and difficulties
- (d) Grievance Handling Mechanism: GHM action plan, please print more posters instead of pamphlets.
- (e) Finance Management: Operation and maintenance costs, management costs, financial training and tax affairs from finance team
- (f) Conflict : ethnic tradition, trust and culture, ways to connect with conflict groups.
- (g) Gender : womens participation in non-infrastructure works/ meeting, same opportunity & wages.
- (h) Procurement: the following should be included in Procurement Form 3 (P 3) *'to buy at shops approved/licensed for construction work materials and minuted'*."

13. The challenges, lessons learned, and recommendations of the project cycle emerging from this fourth year union-level multi-stakeholder review are important inputs for the next cycle. These outputs will contribute to the updating of the project Operations Manual and development of training materials for the fifth project cycle. The NCDDP approach of grass roots community implementation, with villages selecting their own sub-projects, making their own decisions, and achieving real community ownership, is the right way to meet Myanmar's poverty reduction goal in future.

13. The meeting closed at 17:00hr.

Photos of the Union Multi Stakeholder Review



His Excellency Dr. Aung Thu, Union Minister for Agriculture, Livestock and Irrigation, delivering the opening remarks



Ms. Ellen Goldstein, Country Manager from the World Bank, giving her opening remarks



Outstanding performers from village tracts and villages receiving awards





Group photo of people from Department of Rural Development, World Bank and committee members of prize winning village tracts and villages

U Khant Zaw, Director General of the Department of Rural Development, facilitated a panel discussion that featured Mr. Sean Bradley, from the World Bank, Daw Myat Moe Thwe, Deputy Director General of the Ministry of Social Welfare, Relief and Resettlement and Leo Roozendaal, Country Manager of MercyCorps,



A Member of Parliament (MP) raising a question

Khant Zaw, Director General and U Hla Khaing, Director of the Department of Rural Development answering questions from the participants





Question and answer session with the Media and panel from DRD and World Bank.

Group discussions with participants on related subjects



His Excellency Dr. Aung Thu, Union Minister for Agriculture, Livestock and Irrigation, giving closing remarks



Annexes

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Annex 1 – Schedule of the Union Multi-Stakeholder Review | 11 |
| Annex 2 – Participants at the Union Multi-Stakeholder Review | 13 |
| Annex 3 – Opening Remarks by His Excellency Dr Aung Thu | 14 |
| Annex 4 – Opening Remarks by Ms Ellen Goldstein | 16 |
| Annex 5 – Detailed Outputs of MSR Discussion Groups | 19 |

Annex 1: Agenda



Myanmar National Community-Driven Development Project

THE THIRD ANNUAL UNION LEVEL MULTI-STAKEHOLDER REVIEW

Myanmar International Convention Center II (MICC 2), Nay Pyi Taw

21-22 September, 2017(Draft)

| Thursday, 21 September, 2017 | |
|-------------------------------------|---|
| 08:30 – 09:00 | Registration |
| 09:00 – 09:30 | Welcome and Opening Remarks <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Aung Thu, Minister for Agriculture ,Livestock and Irrigation • Ms. Ellen Gold Stein, Country Director, The World Bank |
| 09:30 – 10:00 | Session 1: Award Ceremony for Cycle 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Presentation of awards to representatives of forty-two village tracts across all project townships, based on their performance in the fourth project cycle. |
| 10:00 – 10:30 | Coffee Break |
| 10:30 – 11:00 | Session 2: Highlights from Cycle 4 Project Implementation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Presentations by the Department of Rural Development (DRD) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ Results to date on impact of NCDDP (short video) ➢ Summary of social audits at communities and township-level MSRs ➢ Recommendations for improvement for the next cycle |
| 11.00 – 11.30 | Questions and Answers |
| 11:30 – 12:30 | Session 3: Panel Discussion: CDD – Empowering Community Resilience <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • U Khant Zaw, Director General, Department of Rural Development, Ministry of Livestock, Fisheries and Rural Development • Sean Bradley, Lead Social Development Specialist, World Bank • Dr. San San Aye, Director General, Department of Social Welfare, Ministry of Social Welfare, Relief and Resettlement • Leo Roozendaal, Country Director, Mercy Corps/Myanmar |
| 12.30 – 12.35 | Brief explanation of session 4 |
| 12:35 – 13:30 | Lunch Break |
| 13:30 – 15:30 | Session 4:Thematic Focus Group Discussions |

| | |
|---------------|--|
| | Themes to include key NCDDP technical and implementation issues including the following 8 sessions: 1. Operations, implementation and management; 2. Infrastructure, O&M, safeguards; 3. Procurement; 4. Financial Management; 5. Accountability and GHM; 6. M&E/MIS; 7. Gender; and 8. Fragility and Conflict |
| 15:30 – 16:00 | Coffee Break |
| 16.00 – 16:30 | Closing Session: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Closing Remarks |

| DAY 2: Friday, 22 September 2017 | | | | |
|---|--|---|---|--|
| 08:30 – 09:00 | Registration | | | |
| 09:00 – 09:45 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Facilitator will provide the flow of Day 2 and the instructions for breakout sessions. Participants will choose to attend one of four breakout sessions in the morning and afternoon based on their interests and expertise. Each breakout session will assign a rapporteur to report back in Session 6 In each breakout session, participants will be divided into smaller groups and discuss the following items: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review their experiences and identify challenges in relation to the topic; What should be improved in the next project cycle? | | | |
| 09:45 – 10:00 | Coffee Break | | | |
| 10:00 – 12:00 | Session 5: Breakout Sessions | | | |
| | Way Forward Beyond CDD(Sustainable) | Conflict and CDD | Disaster Response /Emergencies and CDD | Grievance/Gender/Social Safeguards/ Communications |
| | Facilitators: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> U KyawSwa Aung, Director, Department of Rural Development Mr. Luqman Leckie, Team Leader, Union TA Ingo Wiederhofer, Lead Social Development Specialist, The World Bank | Facilitators: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> U HlaKhy, Director, Department of Rural Development Win ZawHtun, Infrastructure Expert, Department of Rural Development Nikolas Myint, Senior Social Development Specialist, The World Bank Nodoka Hasegawa, Senior Social Development Specialist, The World Bank | Facilitators: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> DawMeeMeeHtwe, Deputy Director, Department of Rural Development Aung Wai Tun, Infrastructure Expert, Department of Rural Development Wasittee Udchachone, Consultant, Environment Safeguards, The World Bank | Facilitators: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mr. Terence Kadoe, Grievance Handling Specialist, Union TA. DawEiSandar, Communication Expert, Department of Rural Development Daw Yin Yin Min, National Gender Specialist Kyoko Kusakabe, International Gender Specialist DawEiEiHtwe, Social Development Specialist, The World Bank |
| 12:00 – 13:00 | Lunch Break | | | |
| 13:00 – 13:30 | Session 6: Reporting Back from the Breakout Sessions | | | |
| 13:30 – 14:00 | Closing Remarks | | | |

Annex 2 – List of UMSR Participants

| No. | Department/ Minister | Attendance | Remark |
|-----|--|------------|--------|
| 1. | Minister of Agriculture, Livestock and Irrigation | 1 | |
| 2. | Deputy Minister of Agriculture, Livestock and Irrigation | 1 | |
| 3. | Councillors of Nay Pyi Taw Council | 3 | |
| 4. | Committee member of Pyithu Hlittaw Agriculture, Livestock and Community Development Committee | 1 | |
| 5. | Committee members of Pyithu Hluttaw Farmers and Workers Committee | 3 | |
| 6. | Committee members of National Hlittaw Agriculture, Livestock and Fishery Development Committee | 3 | |
| 7. | Committee members of National Hluttaw Farmers Committee | 3 | |
| 8. | Secretary of a Government Ministerial Department | 3 | |
| 9. | Members (DACU) | 1 | |
| 10. | Director General | 11 | |
| 11. | Rector | 1 | |
| 12. | Deputy Secretary of a Government Ministerial Department | 2 | |
| 13. | Deputy Director General | 22 | |
| 14. | Assistant Secretary of a Government Ministerial Department | 1 | |
| 15. | Pyithu Hluttaw Representatives of (47) Project Townships | 101 | |
| 16. | Representatives of World Bank (Myanmar) | 10 | |
| 17. | International Growth Centre | 2 | |
| 18. | AICS | 3 | |
| 19. | SIU, Thailand | 2 | |
| 20. | Department of Community Development | 110 | |
| 21. | Ministry of Finance and Planning | 2 | |
| 22. | Office of Auditor General | 12 | |
| 23. | Ministry of Social Welfare, Relief and Resettlement | 1 | |
| 24. | Myanmar Economic Bank (Nay Pyi Taw) | 1 | |
| 25. | Members of Technical Committee | 10 | |
| 26. | DRD Directors of States and Regions, Officer-in charges of State and Region CDD Offices, Township Officers of DRD, | 98 | |
| 27. | Union TAs | 38 | |
| 28. | Project Officer-in charges (DRD, TTA) | 96 | |
| 29. | Township Administrators | 41 | |
| 30. | Administrators of Project Village Tracts, Awarded Village Tracts | 118 | |
| 31. | Township Auditors | 43 | |
| 32. | INGO/ NGO | 29 | |
| 33. | Media Men | 30 | |
| | Total | 803 | |

Annex 3: Opening Remarks from His Excellency Dr. Aung Thu, Union Minister for Agriculture, Livestock and Irrigation

Good morning to you all on this auspicious occasion !

It is a great opportunity and a pleasure to extend my heartfelt greetings and cordial welcome to honorable Union Ministers, Chairmen of Parliamentary Affairs Committees and Members of Parliament, Ambassadors and Embassy representatives, Deputy Ministers, the World Bank Delegation, Departmental Officials, development partners, Representative of project villages and Distinguished Guests participating in this magnificence event.

Ladies and gentlemen,

The rural communities of this country represent about 70% of the total population, so we can say it is the backbone of our country. Just as the backbone of a man can support him to stand strongly, the role of rural communities, the backbone of our country, is very important in making our country strong and improved. The State Counsellor also confirmed this in a talk to rural youth that she gave earlier in April.

The NCDDP project, which is jointly implemented by Department of Rural Development under our Ministry and the World Bank, is one of the important elements of our national development strategy. With the objective of ensuring social infrastructure development, an essential part of rural development, the CDD project has now completed its fourth cycle, bringing about improved public services through a people-centered approach, creating resilient communities and capacity development,

Ladies and gentlemen,

Our country's economic policy is people-centered, and aims to achieve inclusive and sustainable development. The CDD project well reflects the country's economic policy. In NCDDP villages, the project is planned and implemented by the community themselves, including selection of basic social infrastructure, implementation, monitoring and management from start to finish. In order to ensure that project benefits are enjoyed by all people, a key approach of this project is to safeguard the inclusion of minority groups and vulnerable people, and also of gender equality. Evidence to date shows that the project can provide sustainable development of infrastructure and bring maximum benefits to the public because it is integrated with an Operation and Maintenance plan for the sustainability of completed project activities. The basis of good governance is transparency and accountability. Applying good practices of transparency and accountability, the rural people meet their needs of infrastructure development in their own villages. That is the reason we can assure that the project is successful in encouraging good governance practices and fostering good practices of democracy amongst the community.

At the same time as rural people are applying collaborative practices in discussion, decision-making and activities, rural roads, bridges, water supply, electrification, education and health infrastructure is being developed, resulting in the improvement of community welfare and living standards. In this way, the United Nations' Sustainable Development Goals (Goals 5,6,7 & 9) can be achieved at the same time.

While undertaking project activities, to ensure the best use of resources and compliance with the guidelines, three types of audits have been conducted: technical audits are undertaken by the DRD and World Bank, financial audits are conducted by the Auditor General Office, and social audits are carried out by the local community themselves.

To ensure the sustainability of completed infrastructure activities and to avoid the repeated damages due to natural disaster, the project is being implemented with the infrastructure design for environmental adaptation and disaster resilience. On the other hand,

in order to build the resilient communities, the project is mainstreaming important concepts such as stability, responsiveness and adaptive capacity.

Ladies and gentlemen,

This year has been the fourth year that we have organized the multi-stakeholder review meeting of NCDDP project annually. Based on the fruitful discussions and recommendations from the previous review meetings, we have overcome the challenges of the project and undertaken better implementation year by year. Up to the time of this MSR, the project has covered 8,565 villages with 14,538 sub-projects, bringing the fruits of development to more than 5.2 million people in 47 townships. Job opportunities were provided to 264 national experts and 2050 graduates in the project areas. Although it is right to say that the NCDDP has gained momentum, we still need to improve our service delivery mechanisms and procedures by sharing experiences, learning lessons and addressing challenges.

Today a multi-stakeholder review meeting has been organized for this purpose. Your contribution in this review meeting in the form of recommendations, suggestions, experiences and views will be key to the future success of the project. They will be used to revise the design of the coming year's project implementation.

I would like to urge all the participants to share your ideas and thoughts openly and frankly. I would also like to ask the World Bank and Department of Rural Development to seriously take notice of the recommendations and comments from this event for the effective implementation for the upcoming year.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

We have completed the fourth project cycle implementation successfully in the first three townships, and this has been accomplished as a result of the productive cooperation of the rural community. In the remaining sixty townships, we continue to implement those activities successfully because of the active cooperation of the rural communities, and I would like to express my great gratitude to all these rural communities in the NCDDP villages.

I would also like to acknowledge and express my gratitude to the project staff who assist the communities with technical support, so that they can complete the sub-projects themselves. I would like to recommend the project staff to learn lessons from the experience of this year, and continue their effort to succeed in the coming years, so that they can better serve our communities.

I would like to conclude my speech here by recommending these communities to utilize our project staff's capacity to implement the CDD project together with you, in cooperation with you the public to achieve the objective of this ministry to increase the standard of living of the rural communities.

Thank you all.

Annex 4: Opening Remarks by Ms Ellen Goldstein, World Bank Country Director for Myanmar, Cambodia and Lao PDR

Excellencies, Colleagues, Friends,

Thank you

- It is my great pleasure to deliver opening remarks at this fourth annual union-level multi-stakeholder review for the national community driven development project. This annual performance review for the project is a critical component of the project's commitment to continued learning, and I want to thank all of you for taking the time to be here today to contribute your thoughts and suggestions.

We are at the end of a great year

- We come together with the project having just completed its fourth year of operations working at village, village tract, and township levels across the country. In the last year, the project has been scaled up to all States and Regions of the country, almost doubling in size to cover a total of approximately 8,600 villages in 47 townships that are home to more than 5 million people.
- This cycle has delivered tremendous results on the ground, with tangible impacts on the day-to-day lives of communities. Schools have been expanded and improved, footpaths, roads, bridges and jetties rehabilitated, and new water supply systems built. You will hear more about the specific progress in these areas but the almost 14,000 subprojects completed to date, including 6,800 in the last 12 months alone, in support of a wide-range of essential rural services has been truly impressive.
- First, it is important to recognize that it is the members of the **beneficiary communities**, many of whom are here with us and will be honored today, who have led this work by identifying development needs, preparing investment plans, overseeing and participating in construction, and managing these project resources themselves.
- These results are also testament to the hard work of the over 2,100 **facilitators** working on the project, the majority of whom are hired locally in the township that they serve.
- Finally, the program's success to date is a reflection of the dedication and leadership by the **Department of Rural Development**, with the overall support and guidance of the Minister, in piloting and working to refine a new way for government to work together with poor communities to serve their priority needs.
- I am happy to report that this approach is working: Communities are showing their support for the program with household participation rates at 65% for the newest townships, and more than 60% overall, with an increasing rate of women's participation. A recent gender assessment carried out by two of the program's implementing partners showed nearly 48% participation of women, increasing sensitivity of men to the capacities of women, and increased confidence and interest on the part of women to take on more community leadership roles. And an assessment

from last year showed that the NCDDP not only successfully delivers subprojects across a range of technical areas, but is doing so at high technical quality and at lower costs than comparable programs.

- I am also particularly impressed with the robust Grievance Redress Mechanism of the NCDDP. This mechanism is a clear indication of the program's dedication to transparency and accountability. Having received almost 11,000 comments or complaints since the start of the project, the resolution rate is an impressive 97.6%. The system was reviewed and is cited as a good practice by World Bank social accountability specialists.
- Most importantly, the project has demonstrated a new way of working, in partnership with communities and local stakeholders. This has included working closely with ethnic armed organizations in fragile contexts as the project expanded to Kayin and Kayah areas, as well as deepening partnerships with civil society.

But we also have a challenging year ahead

- But the project cannot afford to rest on its successes, and that is why we are here today. The government has an ambitious agenda to make the benefits of this project available to as many poor communities across the country as possible and plans to scale up the program to another 16 townships in the coming months. Of these, at least 7 are fragile or conflict affected, including one in Rakhine State, which will require special attention and specialized approaches.
- Once fully scaled up, the project will be operating in 60 townships covering almost 11,500 villages home to an estimated 7 million people, some of whom are the poorest and most vulnerable in Myanmar. That makes it all the more important to get critical things right.
- Previous stakeholder review meetings have recommended important changes to how the project operates. These include how funds are allocated to the village tracts, adjustments to improve women's subproject leadership role, how training is designed and delivered, and important simplifications to subproject documentation. I invite you to continue to take the responsibility of the review forum seriously to assess and recommend adjustments that will continue to improve project implementation.
- For example, more and more townships are starting the process of transferring project management responsibilities from implementation partners to DRD. This is appropriate in the long-run for a program that the government sees as key to its poverty reduction efforts. It is, nonetheless, a significant challenge to Government capacities to fully staff and take on the responsibilities of implementing the project. A transition phase is included in the project design that will need to be managed carefully. Open and constructive dialogue with all stakeholders to draw out lessons learned will also be critical to make this work.
- This year DRD will also undertake with the World Bank a detailed assessment of the project's progress to date and the likelihood of achieving its ultimate objective. This mid-term review is a chance to reflect critically on the approach that the project uses and how this may more broadly fit with the Government's overall development strategies. It is an important milestone for the World Bank and I urge all stakeholders to prepare for this and take the task seriously.

That's why we have to keep on improving

- And there are bound to be other challenges. That is why it is critical to keep on learning and improving. The best performing projects are not the ones that had the perfect design, but the ones that can learn, adapt and improve over time, as NCDDP has been doing from its start.
- In reflecting on the theme of this multi-stakeholder review—resilience—and on some of the words of the Minister, this event is in keeping with core principles of resilience: diversity, feedback, open to critique and seeking ways to improve. On these dimensions, NCDDP is doing a tremendous job – through your regular subproject monitoring and grievance redress systems, the social audits at the village level, the township multi-stakeholder reviews, and through today’s event. The NCDDP is not just helping to make communities resilient, but I believe it is also making communities more resourceful to respond to and take advantage of current and future challenges they face. This in my mind is the essence of empowerment, which is at the core of the NCDDP.
- Therefore, I hope you will all join me in making this important event a success for the project and the people of Myanmar.
- Let me close by saying that it is an honor for me as the Country Director of the World Bank to be here today. The Bank considers the NCDDP one of the most successful projects in our Myanmar portfolio. An while I’m pleased to represent the World Bank here today as one of the programs key supporters, I would also like to take this chance to acknowledge those Governments— of Italy, Japan, and the United Kingdom— and their respective development agencies for their financial support of this program. Along with the Government of Myanmar and the communities themselves, we are all in this together.

Thank you.

Annex 5: Detailed Outputs of MSR Discussion Groups

1. Operations, Implementation and Management

| No. | Title | Key suggestions to update the OM and Guidelines |
|-----|---------------------------|--|
| 1 | STAFF MANAGEMENT | Local persons should be prioritized for employment as a CF. Need good recommendation from authority if the TF is experienced from old townships. He/she can give advice. Local 70%, other 30% |
| | | If someone takes maternity leave, pieceworkers who don't have experience should be hired. Committee experienced, qualified and who have applied for CF before, understand about the project should be hired. It should be carried out with TL review. Unable to find the proper person, the suitable CF should co-serve and Team should manage it. (When procurement and INGO/NGO contracting, all leave of absence benefits including maternity leave should be included in contract. If the new staff arrives, the replacement person needs to agree to leave the work.) |
| | | Handover should be within one month, the relevant DRD should handle together. Union DRD set to replace. (The replacement of State/Region DRD staff should be requested to State/Region Head and Union DRD authorizes it). It should be in the contract of all TTA providers that they must carry out at least 1 cycle. |
| 2. | PROJECT CYCLE | Section (3,4) Step (6,7,8) (Should not be merged), Section (6) Step (13,14) (Should not be merged), 1 st and 2 nd meeting should be held together as one (no need to be held together), specify the conflict area, define 30% participants (Directive & OM), the detailed measures of Step (1+2)(6+7) should be included (Training) |
| | | Separate guideline for required checklist and files format to put in village and township -respective units (Directive) |
| 3. | V.D.P | Give more time for VDP, inform 1 week in advance before financial audit arrives. Although using problem tree is good, only TSP should teach and do not include in VDP (Even though Problem Tree should be used, it would not be added in VDP. (To teach carefully for writing PRA Tool review from Training.) |
| 4. | CLUSTER MANAGEMENT | TTA should take responsibilities of their own duties and CM duties. Since CM doesn't need to be implemented permanently CM should be used in a suitable way in every township. (Team needs to assign jobs for CM. It is not related with Team Management. (No need for OM change, or DRD directive) |
| | | Clear specifications of the responsibilities of Township TTA/DRD/ Region. Ensure clarity is made between management or supporting roles. The responsible person from State/Region should be in a supporting and/or advisory role, not management role. Regional meeting should be held once a month. (Directive) |

| | | |
|-----------|----------------------|--|
| | | TTAs should perform their own duties stated in TOR. Field visit should be calculated according to the % in Log Sheet. (Team Management) |
| 5. | COMMUNICATION | NCDDP brochures should be made and distributed. The union team should specify who needs to attend the TPIC/UMSR meeting. (Directive) |
| | | Myanmar Font (Zawgyi & Myanmar3) should be used (already) |
| | | To copy/cc all DRD/TTAs when sending email. Township also coordinated with TL before sending (Email-DRD/TTA/T.L/CC to NPA). To send relevant TTA/Counterpart (Directive) |
| | | Simple picture, text should be included. Write ethnic language according to the region. To distribute the documents in time (Directive) |
| | | Video should be consistent with OM |
| | | GOV/NGO/INGO should hold meetings quarterly, consult with G.D.A |
| | | Region should hold meetings monthly. (Directive) |
| | | COMMU/GREV/GENDER (SACG) should be only 1 person. (DRD – 2, TTA – 1) (Directive) |
| 6. | TRAINING | All TTA-TTF should attend the meeting. Only 2 nd year refresher should be conducted. |
| | | State and Region staff should be given training together. (Team needs to give directive) |
| | | Meal allowance 1500 kyats should be given. To give training to PIC (advocacy) (union training directive.) |
| | | Training about the project should be delivered to State and Region. |
| | | Video Editing Training should be given to Region |
| 7. | INFRA | Tools should be provided to carry out soil tests, yield strength tests and c.s.t. Leveling Instruments should be provided to State and Region. Basic Structural Design should be taught. |

2. Infrastructure, O&M and Safeguards

| No | Title | Suggestion for OM | Suggestion for Training | Suggestion for other instruction, not for OM |
|----|-------------|---|-------------------------|--|
| 1 | PC-14 | <p>-Pg -144, Form-14</p> <p>(1) To change “<i>Occupation</i>” instead of “<i>Position</i>” of Land owner. (only for Myanmar version)</p> <p>(2) In the second table, to state exactly “land type” instead of “land situation for SP” For example- (Farm-Land, Housing land with grant/ without grant) to extend the column with enough space)</p> <p>(3) To replace ‘The affected area (square) feet’ with ‘Donation area’ instead.</p> <p>(4) Voluntary Donation. If the land owner does not want to donate, he/she can reject by not signing the form. To change ‘If it is wished to request compensation for the land owner, an adjustment can be made with the village apparatus in other suitable ways without using project fund’ instead of ‘Available compensation’.</p> <p>(5) For signing of land donation, the ‘Village administrator’ should sign as a witness (1).</p> <p>(6) As a witness (2), (See Annex (1)), suggested to change the above.</p> | - | |
| 2 | Block Grant | <p>Pg15/ paragraph -26- line 3:</p> <p>(1) To change ‘a <i>priority sub-project should have at least (1.5) million based on the village needs</i>’ instead of ‘<i>In the second and third year, each sub-project should have at least (2) million</i>’</p> <p>Pg- 16, Paragraph - 27, Line – 8</p> <p>(2) To change ‘The DRD union office should be informed (within one month) instead of (immediately).</p> | | - |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|--|
| 3 | O&M | <p>Pg- 89, Paragraph - 291 (e) (5)</p> <p>In the last year, not only 5% block grant but also the excess funds can be used for operation and maintenance. Pg- 222, Paragraph-371</p> <p>Should add one more paragraph relating with O&M plan:</p> <p>(1) To add in the O&M plan- In the project final year townships (The excess funds of project final year + incidental excess funds + 5%)</p> <p>(2) Each representative from villages should be performed in the use of O&M fund allocation.</p> <p>(3) In the final year townships, in order to keep O&M funds, there should form new O&M committee with (5) members and it will allow to use with (3) committee members' signature.</p> | <p>Training team should provide detailed training regarding O & M plan and fund allocation at VT and village level: In the final year townships, the excess funds of project final year + incidental excess funds + 5% are reserved for the O&M fund.</p> | |
| 4 | Ecops and EMP | <p>(1) Pg – 238, table 5-6 (e) To confirm English to Myanmar translation difference (Measurement) (min 80x80x100cm)</p> <p>(2) Pg -238, table 5-6, <u>Under the Sub-Project Type title</u></p> <p>To change '<i>under 40 KV</i>' instead of '<i>under 20 KV</i>'</p> | <p>Some kind of seminar/workshop should be held by township TPIC in order to familiarize all stakeholders with the Environmental rules & regulations, principles and procedures (Eg; Ministry of Forestry, ECD)</p> | |
| 5 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Different local price • Price issued by administrative office • The price issued by audit | <p>Pg-83; Paragraph 272</p> <p>To add after the last sentence - '<i>In the revised estimate, it can be calculated using local prices</i>'</p> | | |

| | | | | |
|---|--|--|---|--|
| | • local price | | | |
| 6 | Environmental & Social Safeguards | <p>Pg.182 – <u>Sub-Project Contractor’s Code of Conduct</u></p> <p>- To add ‘<i>Labour must be used construction safeguard materials</i>’</p> | in order to raise awareness regarding Environmental & Social Safeguards at the community level,, exact rules & regulations should be set, together with knowledge building discussions, as a carrot and stick system. If community do not use the official guidelines, we should use awareness discussions and posters. | |
| 7 | Disaster Risk Management | To state DRM form in OM with new (PC) | | |
| 8 | Sub-Projects not eligible for funding | <p>(1) Pg – 49, Item (9)</p> <p>To change ‘<i>Certain sub-projects which will be financed</i>’ instead of ‘<i>Sub-project scheduled to be financed</i>’</p> | | |
| 9 | Eligible sub-projects | <p>Pg – 48, Paragraph – 132</p> <p>(1) To include and confirm cremation machine, cemetery hall agreed by over 75% of communities’ signature agreement</p> <p>(2) Item No – 3, exact measurements should be given for: ‘<i>Rural road and small bridge</i>’ (Eg; Under 50 feet (for only first year)</p> <p>(3) Item No -5, To add lamp post extension (Lamp post work) in ‘Rural Electrification’</p> <p>(4) Item No – 8, to include the word ‘<i>benefited area</i>’ after the ‘<i>25 hectares</i>’.</p> <p>OM Pg – 48, paragraph – 132, Positive list</p> | | |

| | | | | |
|----|---------------|--|---|--|
| | | To add - Renovation or extended small scale projects or 'can be performed under 1.5 million new projects' | | |
| 10 | PC-11 | Pg-137 To add the word " <i>DRD infrastructure Counter Part</i> " instead of ' <i>Township Engineer</i> ' | | |
| 11 | PC-13 | Pg.139 - E1. Regarding with ' <i>wetlands (swamps, polder areas, seasonally inundated areas)</i> ': <i>Yes --- No----</i> ' Seasonal flooded area such as Moenyo, Kyaukkyi and Tharbaung have to use EMP for each SP. ' <i>wetlands (swamps, polder areas, seasonally inundated areas)</i> ' should be left out as an exception. | | To give separate directive not to do EMP for each SPs for seasonal flooding townships such as Monyo, Kyaukkyi, Thabaung as an exception. |
| 12 | PC-15 | Pg-146: To change only English version: " <i>Environmental Management Plan and Physical Cultural Resource Management Plan</i> " | | |
| 13 | Form P6 | To add – (1) In payment calculation of contract, the payment should be according to the approval of related engineer. (2) See the Annex (2) for the payment %. | - | - |
| 14 | Project cycle | TF Due to emergency implementation, - Since all the processes are done in a rush and TFs have very limited time for survey and estimation, difficulties have been encountered during implementation. The detailed measurement and estimation time takes 2 weeks for TF for the selected sub-projects before submitting to TPIC. This should be | - | To release the strict guidelines for TF mandatory cooperation when making procurement plan. |

| | | | | |
|----|-------|---|---|---|
| | | <p>included in the OM.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - “To do technical tests for sub-projects if necessary” should be included in OM <p>-E.g- Soil test, GPS test, CBR test, Concrete strength test, yield strength test, etc.)</p> | | |
| 15 | PC-6 | Form PC 6 , Pg -126 : To change ‘ <i>Technical Facilitator</i> ’ instead of ‘ <i>Technical Specialist</i> ’ | - | - |
| | PC-14 | <p>Besides affected persons and project heads, witness signature should be the village administrator.</p> <p>Note: Any land donation which is not witnessed by the village administrator should be signed by field clerk (or) Assistant Land Record Officer at the related township land record department.</p> | - | - |

3. Procurement

| No | Title | Suggestion for OM and guideline |
|----|------------------------------|--|
| 1 | Form P-1 | There is no edition for the CF/TF/KE forum output |
| 2 | Form P-2 Procurement plan | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> For design and estimation, there should do monitoring at project area and <input type="checkbox"/> After receiving approval, it should give to the procurement committee to prepare procurement plan |

| | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> In the disbursement, to edit Payment No 1 – 10%, Payment No 2 – 40% and Payment No 3 – 50%. Community force should be as a contractor or not? <input type="checkbox"/> Which amount should do contract hiring <input type="checkbox"/> Should edit rules and regulations for contractors <input type="checkbox"/> Should edit under (15) labor by studying the updated child law and labor law | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------|---|---|----------------|-------|--------------------|-------------|--|-----|-------------|-------------|--------|-------|----|---|----------------------|--|--|----|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|--|--|----|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|--|--|----|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|--|--|----|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|--|--|----|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|--|--|----|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|--|--|----|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|--|--|
| 7 | Responsibility for procurement forms filling | <table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <thead> <tr> <th colspan="2" style="text-align: center;">အခြေခံအားဖြင့်</th> <th style="text-align: center;">ပြင်ဆင်မှုအားဖြင့်</th> <th colspan="2" style="text-align: center;">အကျိုးအမြတ်</th> </tr> <tr> <th style="text-align: center;">စဉ်</th> <th style="text-align: center;">ဖွဲ့စည်းပုံ</th> <th style="text-align: center;">အကျဉ်းချုပ်</th> <th style="text-align: center;">အကျိုး</th> <th style="text-align: center;">အမြတ်</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>၀၀</td> <td>စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာ (စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာ)</td> <td>စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာ</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>၀၁</td> <td>စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာ စည်းကမ်းချက်</td> <td>စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာ စည်းကမ်းချက်</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>၀၂</td> <td>စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက်</td> <td>စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက်</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>၀၃</td> <td>စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက်</td> <td>စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက်</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>၀၄</td> <td>စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက်</td> <td>စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက်</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>၀၅</td> <td>စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက်</td> <td>စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက်</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>၀၆</td> <td>စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက်</td> <td>စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက်</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>၀၇</td> <td>စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက်</td> <td>စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက်</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> | အခြေခံအားဖြင့် | | ပြင်ဆင်မှုအားဖြင့် | အကျိုးအမြတ် | | စဉ် | ဖွဲ့စည်းပုံ | အကျဉ်းချုပ် | အကျိုး | အမြတ် | ၀၀ | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာ (စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာ) | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာ | | | ၀၁ | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာ စည်းကမ်းချက် | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာ စည်းကမ်းချက် | | | ၀၂ | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | | | ၀၃ | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | | | ၀၄ | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | | | ၀၅ | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | | | ၀၆ | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | | | ၀၇ | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | | |
| အခြေခံအားဖြင့် | | ပြင်ဆင်မှုအားဖြင့် | အကျိုးအမြတ် | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| စဉ် | ဖွဲ့စည်းပုံ | အကျဉ်းချုပ် | အကျိုး | အမြတ် | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| ၀၀ | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာ (စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာ) | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာ | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| ၀၁ | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာ စည်းကမ်းချက် | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာ စည်းကမ်းချက် | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| ၀၂ | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| ၀၃ | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| ၀၄ | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| ၀၅ | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| ၀၆ | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| ၀၇ | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | စာချုပ်ချုပ်ဆိုရေးရာစည်းကမ်းချက် | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 8 | Training | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Should give unit training by collecting procurement, finance and infra in township and union. <input type="checkbox"/> Should add many Role Play of training design in village level <input type="checkbox"/> To allow for using budget in procurement training (Eg; There was not allow fund in <i>Kun-cha-kone</i> township) <input type="checkbox"/> In State/Region, DRD procurement staff should be allowed to procure <input type="checkbox"/> KE should give training by collecting each cluster of village procurement sub-committee. Should train clearly about procurement grievance letter in GHM training <input type="checkbox"/> Should support common and easy to repair materials from procurement department (Eg; Copiers) <input type="checkbox"/> Should support exact procurement guideline for township office (only for township office affair) | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 9 | Instruction | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> To state exact action in OM Guideline which is not following village level procurement, misusing breaking the rules. If there is obviously of misusing, to take action by village committee including village tract administrator. <input type="checkbox"/> Compensation for losses, set a time to compensate, replacement formation of the committee <input type="checkbox"/> Take action against village for breaking rules and regulations whether knowing or not. (Eg; stop block grant allocation) <input type="checkbox"/> There should be no responsibility for the health of any person who has been investigated during the investigation <input type="checkbox"/> If the supplier/contractors break the rule of contract, there should be instruction for taking action <input type="checkbox"/> Need instruction for adfixing of tax stamp in Proforma invoice/contract | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Software is not matched with the laptop <input type="checkbox"/> Township staff officer can make decision for vehicle/ motorbike repairing cost, and to state each level such as state/region and union <input type="checkbox"/> To state fixed asset report delivery system | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---------------------|--|---|--------------------------------------|--------|----------------|--------------------------------------|--------------|-----|--|----|--------------|-----|--|-----|--------------|-----|--|------|----------------|----|--|--|
| | Duration of Contractor's Responsibility | <input type="checkbox"/> P 6 : the contractor should be responsible for the maintenance of sub-projects within 6 months after the completion of sub-projects, after this 6 month period, the remaining 5% can be disbursed to the contractor. <table border="1" style="margin-left: 40px;"> <thead> <tr> <th>Installment Payment</th> <th>Amount</th> <th>Scheduled Date</th> <th>Payment Conditions % Completed Works</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Payment No 1</td> <td>10%</td> <td></td> <td>0%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Payment No 2</td> <td>40%</td> <td></td> <td>50%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Payment No 3</td> <td>45%</td> <td></td> <td>100%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>After 6 months</td> <td>5%</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> | Installment Payment | Amount | Scheduled Date | Payment Conditions % Completed Works | Payment No 1 | 10% | | 0% | Payment No 2 | 40% | | 50% | Payment No 3 | 45% | | 100% | After 6 months | 5% | | |
| Installment Payment | Amount | Scheduled Date | Payment Conditions % Completed Works | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Payment No 1 | 10% | | 0% | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Payment No 2 | 40% | | 50% | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Payment No 3 | 45% | | 100% | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| After 6 months | 5% | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

4. Social Accountability and Grievance Handling Mechanism (GHM)

| No | Title | Suggestion for OM / Guide line |
|----|--------------------------|---|
| 1 | Information to add in OM | To state in OM the GHM representative of State/Region |
| 2 | | To stop prevent sub-projects from going forward in the project cycle in the case of difficult village where there is less than 100% attendance at the meeting |
| 3 | | Grievance letter should send to township DRD in townships where project cycle is finished |

| | | |
|----|-------------------|--|
| 4 | | Highest level (“horizon”) of Grievance Handling Mechanism should be State/Region level |
| 5 | Other instruction | To issue exclusively instruction relating with Exit Strategy ways |
| 6 | | To include only office contact number in the Phone Sticker distribution |
| 7 | | Should deliver more poster than pamphlet. Township should do on their own by sending soft copy |
| 8 | Training | CSAG should give training at least one time directly to the village support committee. |
| 9 | | Training should include many Case Studies |
| 10 | | At the new project township, township administer and township planning officer should be invited at Start-up Training. |

5. M&E / MIS

| No | Subject | Recommendations for making the changes in OM and guidelines |
|----|-----------------------------------|--|
| 1 | Capacity building training | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To give village level training just for One day. - To describe in the OM about utilizing the budget for Township level trainings. - To give M&E/MIS training to other TTA/ TL/ DRD from townships. |
| 2 | O&M staff | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To keep One M&E/MIS Assistant in Region level. |
| 3 | Gender | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To put Gender session in the report. - To put Gender report in the OM. |
| 4 | PC-1 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To add “field hospital” instead of just hospital. |
| 5 | PC-2 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To add the percentage (%) automatically next to the household table. - To amend the PC-2 design in order to fill up the forms smoothly for the villages that has more than one sub-project. |

| | | |
|----|----------------------|---|
| 6 | PC-3 | - To do more discussions with Union-TA. |
| 7 | PC-4 | - To remove the remaining balance box. Need to think of other solutions in order to add remaining balance. |
| 8 | PC-5 | - Letting to choose the procurement method again. - To add bitumen road in the road types. - To add hard surface road, others, drainage. - To give clear instructions on the contract and the exact beneficiaries. |
| 9 | PC-6 | - TF should sign as a data inserter and DRD Infra should sign as an approver. |
| 10 | PC-7 | - To add sub-project names. - To amend the recommendations in the tablets. |
| 11 | PC-8 | - To add one more line in the VDP upload. |
| 12 | F-6 | - To negotiate again with Union Finance. (Petty cash) |
| 13 | F-7 | - To negotiate again with Union Finance. |
| 14 | HR-1 | - To add a box for CF/TF. |
| 15 | Quarterly Report | - For the Township DRD/Team leader to take responsibility. |
| 16 | PC-9 | - To add a box for State/Region. |
| 17 | Forms | - To describe in the OM that data should be put in the MIS within 15 after filling up the forms. - To change the form names to I in the forms that is related to Infrastructure. - To describe in the OM that original forms must be kept in the office and copies should be kept in the village. |
| 18 | PC-14 | - For the community, VT, village head administrator, 10 house-head and land management committee to sign. |
| 19 | Community Monitoring | - Not to put the new forms in the OM. To print out separately if it requires to use. |

| | | |
|----|-------|---|
| 20 | PC-11 | - Cannot be eliminated, we have to complete it. |
|----|-------|---|

6. Gender Mainstreaming

Participants: 16 townships, Sagaing & Bago Region (DRD/TH/TA), MPs, Cardno, Representative from Italian Agency for Development Cooperation.

Facilitators : DRD/Mercy Corps/Cardno

Participation

- Should organize again and again about the project beneficiary at all meeting
- To organize Ethnic leaders
- There should be exact place, time and attendant for minority groups. Should be organize.
- Invite to women for exclusively meeting
- Making meeting at the women free time
- To give the opportunity for woman participation and discussion, recommendation and recognition
- Knowledge sharing at the meeting (Giving Training to the community)
- In order to get more trusting, giving a chance to discuss with small groups
- Should give the opportunity for woman in their expert section
- To adjust with the authority for woman security at the meeting attending
- Should discuss about the community participation at the meetings
- Let the decision maker, parliament representative and administrators know about the project clearly and want the community to give information
- It should be libraries at the villages and place some books relating with CDD
- Information should be delivered by social networks, radio for information receiving in the community

Worker inclusion/ wages gap

- To do prior discussion to the community at the meeting in order to understand about the objective of project, destination and project process.

- It should clarify about the concept of same work - same wages at the meeting and before the project implementation (Eg; Procurement Plan) (Should be organized at the meeting that improvement of women's capacity and unreliable mindset on men will become by giving same wages for Men & Women.
- Should do job opportunity
- Should give constructional training to women
- Regarding with Myanmar Laws and projects, giving awareness to the owners and contractors for the same wages
- It should to take together in the project implementation in order to be skillful women workers
- For more women job opportunity, support via media

Women Capacity Improvement

- Should give capacity development training to women only
- Should train to be self-confident for women
- Let women to take a lead in the discussion, men should concentrate the women's discussion output and write down, and should encourage to participate actively. (Eg. experiences sharing session)
- Should give Gender awareness training to the men
- To discuss at the meeting in order to get gender balance 50:50 in the Sub-committee
- To get more trust by giving encouragement of woman to woman
- Giving leadership training (CF/TF to community)
- To give awareness training for contractors
- To add same wages in the contracts
- To organize by sharing the welfare of woman leadership experience and woman participation
- Showing IEC, success story and video
- Making individual discussion
- Based on the women interested occupation, make connection with the related organization (Maydoegabar, SME, DRD, NGO, INGO, CSO)
- To support the choosing method of proper livelihood for women before the meetings

7. Sector: Fragility and Conflict (OM)

| No | Topics | Suggestion for OM |
|----|------------------------------|---|
| 1 | OM & instructions | To liberalize procurement guide line and to allow regional price in conflict area |

| | | |
|--|------------------------------|--|
| | OM & instructions | To allow real costs for trip guide fees needed for regions in the conflict area. |
| | OM & instructions | In assignment of CF/TF, persons related with the Ethnic group should be assigned. |
| | OM & instructions | To allow up to (2) weeks for block grant using at the weak security villages and remote village in the conflict area. |
| | OM & instructions | To consider exclusively supporting of block grant allocation at the ethnical control area. |
| | OM & instructions | To arrange exclusively for the village in the conflict area – <i>'a sub-project should be at least (20) million stated in OM'</i> |
| | OM & instructions | Project should provide accidental costs according to the doctor's medical recommendation for the accident of project staff and committee members during the project implementation period. |
| | OM & instructions | To consider another method in committee forming for low population villages at the conflict area |
| | OM & instructions | To issue real-time instruction of the agreement situation with the ethnic groups to townships. |
| | OM & instructions | Staff officers from State/Region should do more adjustment for conflict with the ethnic groups and regional governments. |
| | OM & instructions | To do regular meeting with the related ethnic groups taking a lead by States/Regions in the township of conflict area |
| | OM & instructions | To issue some instruction for enough procuring of support materials for the natural disaster affected area. |
| | Training | During Committee formation or VDP process, the number of participants according to an ethnic, or language and religion must be 50%. |
| | | To do Conflict Training, road trouble and safeguard training before project start at the conflict area. |
| | | To give natural disaster awareness training |