

Summary Note of CSO Meeting - REVISED
World Bank Office, Yangon, 9:30 AM – 11:30 AM, 8th April 2019

The Department of Rural Development (DRD) and the World Bank jointly held a meeting with civil society organizations (CSOs) and NGOs on the Myanmar National Community Driven Development Project (NCDDP) as part of the Bank’s 18th implementation support mission (ISM) for the project. The meeting took place at the World Bank office in Yangon on 8th April 2019. Invitation for the meeting were sent on 27th March 2019.

Such meetings and discussions are hosted by the World Bank at least twice a year to share updates and receive feedback and suggestions on the NCDDP from interested stakeholders. The purpose of the meeting is to promote transparency and coordination with CSOs and international organizations that are interested in NCDDP. The last meeting was held in December 2018.

Participants

- 14 local CSOs and NGOs representatives (see participant list attached).
- Six representatives from the DRD Regional Office in Yangon and Union Office in Naypyidaw.
- Seven staff from World Bank.

The World Bank began the meeting with a presentation providing an overview of the project and status across the country, followed by the interactive discussion with participants.

Question and Answer Session Question/Comment	Answer
NCDDP has received and addressed about 18,000 of the grievance cases. I like to learn how the cases are resolved because in Myanmar, Free Prior Informed Consent (FPIC) laws and policies are weak, but World Bank has strong FPIC policy.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NCDDP has a grievance team at different levels (union, state/region and townships) to investigate and resolve the reported cases. Some of the cases can be resolved internally by the project and DRD. Some cases, NCDDP needs to collaborate with other concerned government departments (general administration department, electricity supply enterprise, land survey department, etc.). • Some example cases that multiple sectors need to involve are mostly related to electricity sub-projects and land issues. • At the village level, grievance sub-committee are formed (with one male and one female participants) and they are responsible for resolving issues. Communities can raise the issues from any channels; through village grievance committee/focal points, by sending letters to grievance boxes, etc. The report can be provided in any local language and open at the requested level.
I raised the needs to study psychological impact analysis of NCDDP in the previous meeting. But the meeting minutes noted this as social and behavior change. Need to measure the extend of dependency of individuals. Facilitation, knowledge and learning component of NCDDP – what are the	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I am sure DG has addressed this issue in the previous meeting. This issue has also been raised up by MPs. • The project has 4 main components, excluding the emergency component. 65% of the total finance is targeted to reach directly to community through block grant. • Due to efficiency in project management, this percentage has been increased to 75%.

Question and Answer Session Question/Comment	Answer
<p>activities under this component. For the proposed study, suggest involving universities and consulting with civil societies.</p> <p>Suggested World Bank and DRD for revision of Project Development Objective (PDO) to reflect the important role of CSOs in disaster preparedness, so that CSOs will benefit the capacity building and other support from the project.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Attorney General Office regularly conducts financial audit and we assured our transparency and accountability in managing the project. • The total budget for knowledge and learning seems high but if you look into bigger picture, this is reasonable. • The department has 1,100 staff (pension, resign, etc.) in 2017-18. DRD has several ongoing projects. We are planning to manage our work more and more efficiently and only about 50% of 1,100 people will be replaced. This is for you to understand the challenges the government is facing. • Changing mindset of people – not only government but also CSOs and other development organizations are responsible and need to work together. So that check-and-balance of the country will be improved. • For NCDDP, we encourage community to participate in the project and as a result community contribution in NCDDP is very high. Staff in the project also significantly have increased knowledge, capacity and experience from NCDDP. • This sort of impact study needs right indicators and measurement. And it takes time. Since the NCDDP starts, we have put a robust and well working M&E system. You can go online (NCDDP MIS) and see the results of the project. The mentality of people, you highlighted is very hard to measure. • WB and DRD is planning to conduct social inclusion survey (qualitative survey – baseline and endline) to look into hard-to-measure social aspects. The design of the study is not finalized yet and happy to discuss further. • The WB explained that a proposed revision of the PDO is challenging given the legal nature of the formal statement (incorporated in the financing agreement that is approved by both Parliament and the WB Board). In addition, the reference to emergency response in the PDO is a contingency component and only triggered in the case of national disaster. And any response would not necessarily be managed by DRD, and as such the inclusion of CSOs is not under the control of the Ministry.¹
<p>Physical development – roads, and other infrastructure. I like to know about</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In the last cycle of the project, 5% of the total block-grant amount is allocated to the village for

¹ This issue was discussed with U Aung Min and World Bank separately over the emails (April-June 2019) and at a meeting in World Bank Office (17th June 2019) and as requested by U Aung Min, the meeting note is revised subsequently.

Question and Answer Session Question/Comment	Answer
<p>maintenance. Focal persons at community level (DRD mentioned earlier), after they leave the project, how the project manage to replace their positions.</p>	<p>operations and maintenance (O&M). However, as to the requirement from Finance Department (MOPF), we have to close all the bank accounts and O&M procedures have been adjusted.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • For school and health centers, once they are completed, these are handed over to the respective counterpart department (education, health, etc.) upon completion of the project cycle. Communities also establish pool funds to renovate and maintain the infrastructure as needed. • The project has implemented more than 20,000 sub-projects so far. The O&M issue is discussed for each sub-project since the planning stage. Annually, assessments are carried out for necessary maintenance works. • The sub-committee is composed of at least 3 members and the village level committees have about 17-20 members. When there is any member who leaves their membership, a new member is elected, and other members supports to him/her. • CDD approach and core principle is to empower community 1) to make decision on how the funding will be used, 2) to have transparent in managing the funds and, 3) to provide an eco-system that optimizes the use of community resources and minimize the risk of mis-use of funds and if there is a mis-use to have a system to report and resolve (grievance handing mechanism). • There is no best system, and we evolve slowly by learning lessons and challenges from implementation.
<p>There are different sources of finance and types. I like to know more about this.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Loans and grants. • There are three accounts in the project in Kyat, in Euro and in dollar and at Central Bank and Myanmar Economic Bank. • Italy financing is different as it is debt sway loan and grant and it goes to Myanmar Government, not through World Bank. • World Bank's IDA loans – service charge is 0.75%
<p>I want to know land use in the project. World Bank's safeguard policy also protects indigenous people.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NCDDP has ESSAF when it is started in 2013. Then we use Environment and S • ocial Management Framework (ESMF). Land issues is discussed with all the involved stakeholders and it is found mostly in road and water supply project. The land donation is entirely voluntary and the landowner and everyone involve need to agree for their voluntary land donation. ESMF follows Government and World Bank policies. However,

Question and Answer Session Question/Comment	Answer
	<p>NCDDP's sub-projects are very small infrastructure, unlike big projects (village to village roads).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The ESMF draft was developed with the consultations with CSOs and other stakeholders. The ESMF is disclosed on NCDDP website. • The rural development law currently is drafted and now being reviewed by PyithuHluttaw. In this law, land use related procedures and policies are proposed.
<p>Mindset and attitude change are big issues in Myanmar. Consumer protection is currently being done through consumer education. Because most of the consumers lack knowledge about their rights. Civil society and government are potential partners for us. We like to collaborate with DRD for capacity building of communities and staff, taking advantage of DRD's outreach in rural areas of Myanmar.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • DRD has its own mandate guided by the ministry. As long as it is aligned with our mandate, we are happy to collaborate. • Communities oversee and manage the project. Part of their responsibilities are related to procurement. Procurement sub-committees needs to make sure to get good quality goods/services with reasonable prices. This can be an area to explore for collaboration.
<p>What is the role of different government departments in conflict-affected areas where EAOs has influence?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The basic functions including accountability mechanism of project are same in these areas. Regular consultation between township DRD and project staff and EAOs are conducted and issue of access for example is discussed. Some areas open up over time and close down sometimes due to conflict (e.g. Namhsam). The communications is fluid and it is led by DRD. • DRD provides project presentation and progress to EAOs in project areas. In one of the project villages, the community likes to do gravity flow water project and the water source and piping areas are mine-risk areas. The community facilitates a meeting for DRD and EAO representatives for safety access to these areas. • DRD has invested sufficient time in this process since it requires many meetings. But it really helps both parties to build trust.

Conclusion from World Bank and DRD

DRD and World Bank team thanked all participants for a good discussion. The project also requests meeting participants to extend invitation to other organizations who might be interested in attending. The presentation and a summary note of this meeting would be uploaded onto the NCDDP website. Project information are also readily available on NCDDP website (<http://cdd.drdmyanmar.org/mm>) and MIS (<http://www.ncddmis.com/>).

Participant Sign-in Sheet

CSOs Meeting for NCDDP					
The World Bank Office				April 8, 2019	
No.	Name	Designation	Organisation	Email	Signature
1	U Situ Kyaw		Inya Economics		
2	U Thurein Lwin	Research Coordinator	Inya Economics	thureinlwin.07@gmail.com	
3	U Than Tun Soe		Inya Economics	thureinlwin.07@gmail.com	
4	U Myint Aung				
5	Daw Thiri Oo	Campaign Coordinator	IFI watch	cc.ifiwatchmyanmar@gmail.com	
6	Daw Sharmyar Htwe	Communication Officer	IFI watch	cc.ifiwatchmyanmar@gmail.com	
7	Camille Brunet	Deputy Country Director	Solidarites Int Myanmar		
8	U Su Tin	Chairman	Mingalar Dragon		
9	U Maung Maung	Secretary	Myanmar Consumers Union	mngmnghis.love@gmail.com	
10	Naw Tar Hay Nyaw	Joint Secretary	Myanmar Consumers Union	fannyrackman@yahoo.com	
11	U Banyar Oo	Programme Associate	MCRB	min.banyar.oo@myanmar-responsiblebusiness.org	
12	U Wai Yan Linn Htoon	Communication Officer	Triangle	com.myanmar@triangle.org	
13	Daw Lei Lei Win	Accountant	Treasure Land	treasureland.ngo2015@gmail.com	
14	U A ONE	Project Coordinator	DEAR Myanmar	pc@dearmyanmar.org	
15	Yoshiki Saito	Project Coordinator	CORE	ysaito.love@gmail.com	斎藤芳樹
16	AUNG MIN	ORGANIZER	ENGINEERING WORLD'S	aungmin72.mmp@peace@gmail.com	

17	U Min Zaw	DSO	DRD	minzaw.cdd@gmail.com	8
18	Daw Lei Yin Win	Communications	CDD	leiyinwinj@gmail.com	la
19	Daw Chm Mark Khing	AD	DRD	chmarkhinezz@gmail.com	Handwritten mark
20	Daw Nyo ² Sein	DDG	ORD		Handwritten mark
21	Daw Moe ² Htae	DG	ORD	moe2htae@gmail.com	Moe
22	U Tan Gy's	SO	ORD	gye.vone.cdd.ygw@gmail.com	Gy
23	Leah Rozendaal			lr@paungsiefacility.org	LR
24	Nyo ko ko	POINT FM		point.mkk@gmail.com	Handwritten arrow
25					